

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA  
CIVIL APPELLATE/ORIGINAL/INHERENT JURISDICTION**

**CIVIL APPEAL NO. 5988 OF 2019**

**ANIMAL WELFARE  
BOARD OF INDIA & ANR. ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**PEOPLE FOR ELIMINATION OF  
STRAY TROUBLES & ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**WITH**

**CONTEMPT PETITION (Civil) No. 944/2017 in I.A. No.4/2015**

**in**

**Writ Petition (Civil) No. 599/2015**

**JOSE SABASTIN AND ANR. ... Petitioner(s)**

**VERSUS**

**DR. K.M. ABRAHAM  
CHIEF SECRETARY, STATE OF KERALA ... Respondent(s)**

**Writ Petition(Civil) No. 1439/2019**

**SANJAY KUMAR ... Petitioner(s)**

**VERSUS**

**THE STATE OF  
UTTAR PRADESH AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 5956/2019**

**THE STATE OF KERALA AND ANR. ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**DISTRICT PANCHAYATH  
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY ... Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 5953/2019**

**THE STATE OF KERALA AND ORS. ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**IDUKKI SOCIETY FOR  
PREVENTION OF CRUELTY OF ANIMALS  
IDUKKI DISTRICT AND ANR. ... Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 5955/2019**

**STATE OF KERALA AND ORS. ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**THE ANIMAL WELFARE BOARD OF INDIA  
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,  
MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENTAL AND  
FOREST AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 5948/2019**

**THE STATE OF KERALA AND ORS. ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**DAYA AND ANR. ... Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 5954/2019**

**THE STATE OF KERALA ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**KOCHOUSEPH CHITILAPPILLY AND  
ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**Writ Petition (Civil) No. 319/2020**

**HUMANE FOUNDATION FOR  
PEOPLE AND ANIMALS AND ORS. ... Petitioner (s)**

**VERSUS**

**UNION OF INDIA AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**CONTEMPT PETITION (Civil) No. 40/2022**

**in**

**Civil Appeal No. 5988/2019**

**RISHI DEV ... Petitioner(s)**

**VERSUS**

**DR. JANE PRASAD AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**Diary No(s). 35297/2022**

**SWATI SUDHIRCHANDRA  
CHATTERJEE AND ORS. ... Petitioner(s)**

**VERSUS**

**VIJAY SHANKARRAO  
TALEWAR AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**Respondent(s)**

**Diary No(s). 35322/2022**

**JANICE SMITH ANIMAL  
WELFARE TRUST AND ANR. ... Petitioner (s)**

**VERSUS**

**THE STATE OF MAHARASHTRA  
AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**Special Leave Petition (Civil) No. 20845/2022**

THE PEOPLE FOR ANIMAL TRUST ... Petitioner (s)

VERSUS

VIJAY SHANKARRAO TALEWAR AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)

**Writ Petition(Civil) No. 765/2023**

DIPANKARA SUMEDHO ... Petitioner (s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)

**Civil Appeal No. 5990/2019**

DEFENCE OF ANIMALS  
THROUGH ITS PRESIDENT  
MRS.FIZZAH SHAH ... Appellant(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)

**Civil Appeal No. 5991/2019**

THE SECRETARY,  
MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND  
FORESTS AND ANR. ... Appellant(s)

VERSUS

PEOPLE FOR ELIMINATION OF  
STRAY TROUBLES (PEST) AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)

**Civil Appeal No. 5992/2019**

**WELFARE OF STRAY DOGS  
(PUBLIC CHARITABLE TRUST) ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**PEOPLE FOR ELIMINATION OF  
STRAY TROUBLES AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 6042/2019**

**PEOPLE FOR ELIMINATION OF  
STRAY TROUBLES AND ANR. ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**UNION OF INDIA AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 6551/2019**

**ANIMAL WELFARE BOARD OF INDIA ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**B.KRISHNA BHAT AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 6552/2019**

**NRUPA R. NATHVANI AND ORS. ... Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**UNION OF INDIA THROUGH ITS  
SECRETARY ... Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 6553/2019**

**COMPASSION UNLIMITED PLUS  
ACTION (CUPA) BBMP CUPA  
THROUGH ITS SECRETARY** ... **Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**BRUHAT BANGALORE MAHANAGARA  
PALIKE THROUGH ITS  
COMMISSIONER AND ORS.** ... **Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 5950/2019**

**THE STATE OF KERALA AND ORS.** ... **Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**THICHUR NAZEER AND ANR.** ... **Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 5951/2019**

**THE STATE OF KERALA AND ORS.** ... **Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**HUMAN RIGHTS PROTECTION  
COUNCIL** ... **Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 5952/2019**

**STATE OF KERALA** ... **Appellant(s)**

**VERSUS**

**THE ANIMAL WELFARE BOARD  
OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS  
SECRETARY** ... **Respondent(s)**

**Civil Appeal No. 5989/2019**

VINIYOG PARIVAR TRUST AND ANR. ... Appellant(s)

VERSUS

BRIHAN MUMBAI MUNICIPAL  
CORP. AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)

**Civil Appeal No. 5930/2019**

ANIMAL WELFARE BOARD OF INDIA  
THROUGH ITS SECRETARY ... Appellant(s)

VERSUS

DIMPLE VAHALI OBEROI AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)

**Writ Petition(Civil) No. 599/2015**

ANUPAM TRIPATHI ... Appellant(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)

**Civil Appeal No. 5972/2019**

ANIMAL WELFARE BOARD OF  
INDIA AND ANR. ... Appellant(s)

VERSUS

OMBUDSMAN FOR LOCAL  
SELF GOVERNMENT  
INSTITUTIONS AND ORS. ... Respondent(s)





as '1960 Act' for short), and the rules framed thereunder i.e. the Animal Birth Control Rules, 2001 (hereinafter referred to as '2001 Rules' for brevity), would prevail over the local/Municipal Laws of the concerned States in the management of stray dogs or not?

2. Looking at the first petition, that in specific, the Animal Welfare Board of India preferred Civil Appeal No. 5988 of 2019 assailing the final judgment and order dated 19.12.2008 passed by the three-Judge Bench of the High Court of Judicature at Bombay in appellate side Writ Petition No. 6257 of 2006. The inter play between the provisions of the 1960 Act and the Mumbai Municipal Corporation Act, 1888 and the respective rules/regulations framed/ issued in terms thereof, was the subject matter for consideration before the Court.

3. The said appeal, being the first in the point of time, was preferred as a special leave petition in the year 2009, wherein notice was issued on 23.01.2009 and the operation of the Judgment of the Bombay High Court was stayed and subsequently, leave to appeal granted.

4. Since then, we find much water has flown down. We notice that in the said appeal, several parties

have filed different applications (*about 30* in number) seeking certain directions. Also, several independent petitions (06 in number) stand filed which, over a period of time stand tagged and heard together along with the said appeal, as revealed from the proceedings.

5. We notice that in terms of our order dated 18.11.2015, it stands observed that all the municipal corporation(s), municipal committee(s), district board(s) and local bodies shall be guided by the provisions of the 1960 Act and the 2001 Rules and that it would be the duty and obligation of the Animal Welfare Board, ensuring compliance and follow up action with all earnestness.

6. Subsequently, as is evident from certain orders, several issues were raised by the stakeholders, *inter alia*, ensuring proper and complete implementation framework for the street dogs population management, rabies eradication and reducing man-dog conflict causing hardship as per various divergent pleas taken by them.

7. We also notice that covering the very same issue, while dealing with the similar statutes, different High Courts have taken divergent views. Whereas the

Kerala High Court has upheld the 2001 Rules, further holding that the municipal laws for dealing with the stray dogs should be in compliance with the 2001 Rules and discretionary powers cannot be granted to the municipal authorities for killing the stray dogs. The High Courts of Bombay, Karnataka and Himachal Pradesh have held that the local authorities have discretionary powers to kill the stray dogs for them not to be subjected by the 2001 Rules, notified by the Central Government. The minority judgment of the Bombay High Court is in line with the opinion rendered by the Kerala High Court.

8. Different appeals/special leave petitions (23 in number) arising out of the said orders/judgments also stand filed and as such clubbed with the main appeal. It is also noticed that certain contempt petitions, two in number, were filed and heard along with the main appeal.

9. Well, all this was prior to 10.03.2023, on which date, the Annual Birth Control Rules, 2023, stand notified by the Central Government, Ministry of Fisheries, Animal husbandry and Dairying, and now in force.

10. Considering all the intervening developments and more specifically the enactment of the new Rules putting in place mechanism for preventing the infliction of unnecessary pains and sufferings on animals, more specifically the canines, we intend to close the instant proceedings leaving it open for each one of the parties to pursue their remedies on occasion so arises, if so advised, before the Constitutional Courts, other Forums having respective jurisdiction, in accordance with law.

11. We only hasten to add, that under all circumstances, there cannot be any indiscriminate killings of canines and the authorities have to take action in terms of the mandate and spirit of the prevalent legislation(s) in place. There is no gainsaying in the fact that exhibiting compassion to all living beings, is the enshrined Constitutional value and mandate, and cast obligation on the authorities to maintain.

12. We clarify that all issues, raised in the instant *lis* are kept open to be adjudicated in an appropriate proceedings, before the appropriate forum, in accordance with law. Whether be it may the mechanism in terms of the new Rules deficient/insufficient or

repugnant to the Constitution or the parent statute(s); in our considered view, which can be best considered by the Constitutional Courts or other Forums accounting for all factors and circumstances, local in nature, being germane for adjudication for them and to decide it independently. We are hopeful that as and when any such issue is raised, the same shall be considered expeditiously, in accordance with law, uninfluenced of any one of the observations made in the impugned orders/judgments and the proceedings of these batch of petitions/appeals.

13. With the aforesaid observations, the appeals/petitions stand disposed of. All the applications shall also stand closed.

..... J.  
[J.K. MAHESHWARI]

..... J.  
[SANJAY KAROL]

New Delhi;  
May 09, 2024.

ITEM NO.112

COURT NO.9

SECTION III

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No. 5988/2019

ANIMAL WELFARE BOARD OF INDIA & ANR.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

PEOPLE FOR ELIMINATION OF STRAY TROUBLES & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(IA No. 228159/2023 - ADDITION / DELETION / MODIFICATION PARTIES and IA No. 196166/2022 - APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION and IA No. 245159/2023 - APPLICATION FOR REJECTION OF THE PLAINT and IA No. 141459/2022 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 89077/2022 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 74085/2018 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 38557/2023 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 22823/2022 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No. 77765/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No. 71833/2024 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT and IA No. 196155/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT and IA No. 10860/2018 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 145257/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 50034/2024 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 38561/2023 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 10871/2018 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 5320/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 128421/2023 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 48830/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 6038/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 38549/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 15857/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 71819/2024 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 131449/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 56180/2024 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 228156/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 196151/2022 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 226157/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 189486/2022 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 225000/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 215374/2023 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON and IA No. 206776/2023 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON and IA No. 196161/2022 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON and IA No. 189497/2022 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON and IA No. 38552/2023 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON and IA No. 147935/2022 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES and IA No. 230380/2023 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES and IA No. 50029/2024 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES and IA No. 225876/2023 - PERMISSION TO FILE APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION and IA No. 224055/2023 - WITHDRAWAL OF CASE / APPLICATION)

WITH

Civil Appeal No. 5988/2019 etc.

CONMT.PET.(C) No. 944/2017 in W.P.(C) No. 599/2015 (PIL-W)  
(IA No. 50714/2017 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No.  
41847/2018 - I/A FOR AMENDMENT OF SOLE CONTEMNORS NAME)

W.P.(C) No. 1439/2019 (PIL-W)  
(IA No. 119635/2020 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No.  
188586/2019 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

C.A. No. 5956/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5953/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5955/2019 (XI-A)  
(FOR PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON ON IA 187109/2019)

C.A. No. 5948/2019 (XI-A)

C.A. No. 5954/2019 (XI-A)

W.P.(C) No. 319/2020 (PIL-W)  
(IA No. 24146/2020 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL  
DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES)

CONMT.PET.(C) No. 40/2022 in C.A. No. 5988/2019 (III)  
(FOR ADMISSION)

Diary No(s). 35297/2022 (IX)  
(IA No. 171074/2022 - APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION and IA No.  
170999/2022 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No. 169336/2022 -  
EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT and IA No.  
170996/2022 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 176803/2022 -  
INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 175938/2022 -  
INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 169338/2022 - PERMISSION TO  
FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES and IA No. 169337/2022 -  
PERMISSION TO FILE PETITION (SLP/TP/WP/..))

Diary No(s). 35322/2022 (IX)  
(IA No. 170690/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED  
JUDGMENT and IA No. 170689/2022 - PERMISSION TO FILE PETITION  
(SLP/TP/WP/..))

SLP(C) No. 20845/2022 (IX)  
(IA No. 174849/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED  
JUDGMENT)

W.P.(C) No. 765/2023 (X)  
(IA No. 143732/2023 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS)

C.A. No. 5990/2019 (III)

C.A. No. 5991/2019 (III)

Civil Appeal No. 5988/2019 etc.

**C.A. No. 5992/2019 (III)**  
**(IA No. 2/2015 - PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES)**

**C.A. No. 6042/2019 (III)**  
**(IA No. 1/2010 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING)**

**C.A. No. 6551/2019 (IV-A)**  
**(IA No. 108994/2019 - VACATING STAY)**

**C.A. No. 6552/2019 (IV-A)**  
**(IA No. 243222/2023 - ADDITION / DELETION / MODIFICATION PARTIES**  
**and IA No. 100795/2017 - VACATING STAY)**

**C.A. No. 6553/2019 (IV-A)**  
**(IA No. 243224/2023 - ADDITION / DELETION / MODIFICATION PARTIES**  
**and IA No. 697/2021 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No. 700/2021 -**  
**EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT and IA No. 108987/2019 - VACATING**  
**STAY)**

**C.A. No. 5950/2019 (XI-A)**

**C.A. No. 5951/2019 (XI-A)**

**C.A. No. 5952/2019 (XI-A)**

**C.A. No. 5989/2019 (III)**

**C.A. No. 5930/2019 (XIV-A)**

**W.P.(C) No. 599/2015 (PIL-W)**  
**(IA No. 8781/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No. 3/2015 -**  
**EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 10/2016 - EXEMPTION FROM**  
**FILING O.T. and IA No. 175799/2022 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and**  
**IA No. 155093/2022 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.**  
**147924/2022 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 1/2015 -**  
**PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON and IA No. 6/2016 -**  
**PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON and IA No. 11/2016 -**  
**PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES and IA No. 9/2016 - PERMISSION TO FILE**  
**ANNEXURES and IA No. 8/2016 - PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES)**

**C.A. No. 5972/2019 (XI-A)**  
**(IA No. 99975/2017 - PERMISSION TO FILE APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION)**

**W.P.(C) No. 805/2015 (PIL-W)**  
**(IA No. 7/2017 - AMENDMENT IN CAUSE TITLE and IA No. 151960/2018 -**  
**APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 64919/2018 - APPROPRIATE**  
**ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 131906/2022 - APPROPRIATE**  
**ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 80873/2017 - DELETING THE NAME OF**  
**PETITIONER/RESPONDENT and IA No. 9/2017 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING**  
**O.T. and IA No. 1/2015 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON)**



**W.P.(C) No. 808/2015 (PIL-W)  
(IA No. 2/2015 - DISPENSING WITH SERVICE OF NOTICE)**

**C.A. No. 5947/2019 (XI-A)  
(IA No. 123006/2023 - APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION and IA No. 129897/2023 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 117316/2023 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 121245/2023 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 119872/2023 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 131731/2022 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No. 119871/2023 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 129890/2023 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 128495/2023 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 131989/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 121240/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 230546/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 228130/2023 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 117494/2023 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES)**

**C.A. No. 5949/2019 (XI-A)**

**Date : 09-05-2024 These matters were called on for hearing today.**

**CORAM :**

**HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE J.K. MAHESHWARI  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SANJAY KAROL**

**For parties**

**Mr. Arunabh Chowdhary, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Amol Chitale, Adv.  
Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, Adv.  
Mr. Susheel Joseph Cyriac, Adv.  
Ms. Sonia Dube, Adv.  
Ms. Priya S Bhalerao, Adv.  
Mr. Varun Kanwal, Adv.  
M/S. Lex Regis Law Offices, AOR**

**Mr. Ajit Sharma, AOR**

**Ms. Aparna Bhat, AOR  
Ms. Karishma Maria, Adv.**

**Mr. Sudhanshu S. Choudhari, AOR**

**Ms. Manisha T. Karia, AOR  
Mr. Rohan Trivedi, Adv.  
Ms. Swapnil Baudh, Adv.  
Mr. Dipinshani, Adv.  
Ms. Ananya Arora, Adv.  
Mr. Vikram Chandravanshi, Adv.**

**M/S. Acm Legal, AOR**

**Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, AOR**

**Ms. Shilpa Liza George, Adv.**

**Mr. Km Vignesh Ram, Adv.**

**Mr. Nasib masih, Adv.**

**Mr. Rajeev Kumar Dubey, Adv.**

**Mr. Kamendra Mishra, AOR**

**Mr. Krishnan Venugopal, Sr. Adv.**

**Mr. Debmalya Banerjee, Adv.**

**Mr. Krishnan Agarwal, Adv.**

**Mr. Kartik Bhatnagar, Adv.**

**Ms. Esha Dutta, Adv.**

**Mr. Anmol, Adv.**

**Ms. Shaalini Agrawal, Adv.**

**M/S. Karanjawala & Co., AOR**

**Mr. Sudarsh Menon, AOR**

**Mr. Ashish Verma, Adv.**

**Mr. Rajesh Rathod, Adv.**

**Mr. Shine P. Sasidhar, Adv.**

**Mr. Sarthak Mehrotra, Adv.**

**Mr. Dhruv Tank, Adv.**

**Mr. Aniruddha Awalgaonkar, Adv.**

**Ms. Bhavya Pande, Adv.**

**Ms. Surbhi Kapoor, AOR**

**Mr. Nirbhay Kumar, Adv.**

**Mr. Nishant Mandal, Adv.**

**Mr. Chand Qureshi, AOR**

**Mr. Abhay Kumar, Adv.**

**Mr. Raman Raj Gangwar, Adv.**

**Mr. Shubham Srivastava, Adv.**

**Mr. Shashikant, Adv.**

**Mr. Gurudutt, Adv.**

**Mr. Mohit, Adv.**

**Mr. Deepu Singh, Adv.**

**Mr. Praveen Pathak, Adv.**

**Mr. Avadhesh Kumar Dubey, Adv.**

**Mr. Dewashish Vishwakarma, Adv.**

**Mr. Santosh Anandrao Jadhav, Adv.**

**Mr. Surendra Gautam, Adv.**

**Petitioner-in-person**

**Mr. V. Giri, Sr. Adv.**

**Mr. Pallav Shishodia, Sr. Adv.**

**Mr. C. K. Sasi, AOR**

**Ms. Meena K Poulouse, Adv.**  
**Ms. Anupriya, Adv.**

**Mr. V. K. Biju, AOR**  
**Mrs. Ria Sachthey, Adv.**  
**Mr. Chetanya Singh, Adv.**  
**Mr. Mayank Pandey, Adv.**  
**Mr. Mayankn Pandey, Adv.**

**Mr. Shreekant Neelappa Terdal, AOR**  
**Mr. Vikrant Singh Bais, AOR**

**Mr. Arunabh Chowdhury, Sr. Adv.**  
**Ms. Priya S. Bhalerao, Adv.**  
**Mr. Amol Chiltale, Adv.**  
**Mr. Amol Chitale, Adv.**  
**Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, Adv.**  
**Mr. Susheel Joseph Cyriac, Adv.**  
**Ms. Priya Bhalerao, Adv.**  
**Ms. Sonia Dube, Adv.**  
**Ms. Priya S Bhalerao, Adv.**  
**Mr. Varun Kanwal, Adv.**  
**M/S. Lex Regis Law Offices, AOR**

**Mr. Shakul R. Ghatole, Adv.**  
**Mr. Firdos Mirza, Adv.**  
**Mr. Vatsalya Vigya, AOR**

**Caveator-in-person**

**Mr. Munawwar Naseem, AOR**

**Ms. Anindita Mitra, AOR**

**Mr. Ankit Goel, AOR**

**M/S. Arputham Aruna and Co, AOR**

**Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR**

**Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, AOR**

**Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR**  
**Mr. Manendra Pal Gupta, Adv.**

**Mr. Ratnesh Kumar Shukla, AOR**

**Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee, AOR**

**Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR**

Mr. Shree Pal Singh, AOR

Mr. V. K. Biju, AOR  
Mrs. Ria Sachthey, Adv.  
Mr. Chetanya Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Mayank Pandey, Adv.  
Mrs. Rubina Jawed, Adv.

Mr. B. Balaji, AOR

Mr. Dhananjay Garg, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Garg, Adv.  
Mr. Ishaan Tiwari, Adv.  
Mr. Chanakya Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Dinesh Kumar Garg, AOR  
Mr. Chaudhary Shamsuddin Khan, Adv.  
Mr. Tanuj Gulati, Adv.  
Mr. R.p. Bansal, Adv.

Mr. Ramesh Babu M. R., AOR

Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

Ms. G. Indira, AOR

Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR

Mr. B.k. Satija, A.A.G.  
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR  
Mr. Parth Sarathi, Adv.  
Mr. Gyanendra Vikram Singh, Adv.

Mr. P. V. Dinesh, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Anna Oommen, Adv.  
Ms. Uryashi Chauhan, Adv.  
Ms. Anne Mathew, Adv.  
Mr. P. S. Sudheer, AOR  
Mr. Rishi Maheshwari, Adv.  
Mr. Bharat Sood, Adv.  
Ms. Miranda Solaman, Adv.  
Mr. Paul P. Abraham, Adv.

Mr. M. Gireesh Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Ankur S. Kulkarni, AOR  
Ms. Uditha Chakravarthy, Adv.  
Ms. Shalaka Srivastava, Adv.

Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR

Ms. Uma Devi. M, AOR

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR

Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR

Ms. Anushree Prashit Kapadia, AOR

Mr. Kunal Chatterji, AOR

Ms. Maitrayee Banerjee, Adv.

Mr. Rohit Bansal, Adv.

Ms. Kshitij Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR

Mr. S. Nagamuthu, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Aswathi M.K., AOR

Mr. Tushar Mehta, Solicitor General

Mr. K M Nataraj, A.S.G.

Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.

Mr. R R Rajesh, Adv.

Mr. S K Singhania, Adv.

Mr. Shetty Uday Sagar, Adv.

Mr. Shubhranshu Padhi, Adv.

Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Adv.

Ms. Sweksha, Adv.

Mr. Pahlad Singh Sharma, AOR

Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR

Mr. Narendra Kumar, AOR

Mr. Rahul Chitnis, Adv.

Mr. Siddharth Dharmadhikari, Adv.

Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, AOR

Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.

Mr. Sourav Singh, Adv.

Mr. Aditya Krishna, Adv.

Ms. Preet S. Phanse, Adv.

Mr. Adarsh Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Atul Yeshwant Chitale, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Nirbhay Singh, Adv.

Mr. Madhav Chitale, Adv.

Mrs. Suchitra Atul Chitale, AOR

Mr. Shauryapratapsinh Barhat, Adv.

Mr. Mohan V. Katarki, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Subhash Chandra Sagar, Adv.  
Mr. Hemant Kumar Sagar, Adv.  
Mr. E. C. Vidya Sagar, AOR

Mr. Varinder Kumar Sharma, AOR

Mr. Sureshan P., AOR

Ms. Rukhmini Bobde, Adv.  
Ms. Soumya Priyadarshinee, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Srivastava, Adv.  
Mr. Amlaan Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Vishal Prasad, AOR

Ms. Manisha T. Karia, AOR

Mr. Samir Ali Khan, AOR  
Mr. Pranjal Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Kashif Irshad Khan, Adv.  
Mr. Abhimanyu Jhamba, Adv.

Ms. Ankita Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Arjun D Singh, Adv.

Mr. Shreekant Neelappa Terdal, AOR

Mr. Sourav Roy, AOR

Mr. Anand Grover, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Purushottam Sharma Tripathi, AOR  
Ms. Varnika Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Ravi Chandra Prakash, Adv.  
Mr. Amit, Adv.  
Ms. Vani Vyas, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Tripathi, Adv.  
Mr. Aman Ashesh, Adv.  
Mr. Khuloos Aziz Chawla, Adv.  
Mr. Prakhar, Adv.

Mr. Ajay K. Agrawal, AOR

Mr. Lakshmeesh S. Kamath, AOR  
Ms. Samriti Ahuja, Adv.  
Ms. Aditi Prakash, Adv.  
Mr. Karan Singh Dalal, Adv.

Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Anand Kumar Dubey, Adv.  
Mr. Jainendra Kumar, Adv.  
Ms. Harsha Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Devvrat Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Maneesh Pathak, Adv.  
Mr. Varun Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Simanta Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Prasad, AOR

Mr. Tushar Mehta, Solicitor General  
Mr. K M Nataraj, A.S.G.  
Mr. Kanu Agarwal, Adv.  
Mr. R R Rajesh, Adv.  
Mr. S K Singhanian, Adv.  
Mr. Shetty Uday Sagar, Adv.  
Mr. Shubhranshu Padhi, Adv.  
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Adv.  
Ms. Sweksha, Adv.  
Mr. Piyush Beriwal, Adv.  
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Verma, Adv.  
Mr. Ishaan Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Indira Bhakar, Adv.  
Mr. Mukul Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Rajesh Singh Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Vatsal Joshi, Adv.  
Mr. Varun Chugh, Adv.  
Mr. Shashwat Parihar, Adv.  
Mr. Harish Pandey, Adv.  
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Maroria, AOR  
Mr. Vineet Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sunny Choudhary, AOR

Mr. Mahfooz Ahsan Nazki, AOR  
Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv.  
Mr. Kv Girish Chowdary, Adv.  
Ms. Rajeswari Mukherjee, Adv.  
Mr. Meeran Maqbool, Adv.  
Ms. Archita Nigam, Adv.

Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR

Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR  
Mr. T.k. Nayak, Adv.  
Ms. Marbiang Khongwir, Adv.  
Mrs. Rekha Bakshi, Adv.

Mr. Som Raj Choudhury, AOR

Mr. D. Kumanan, AOR  
Mrs. Deepa. S, Adv.  
Mr. Sheikh F Kalia, Adv.  
Mr. Veshal Tyagi, Adv.

Mr. Aravindh S., AOR  
Ms. Ekta Muyal, Adv.

Ms. Swati Ghildiyal, AOR  
Ms. Devyani Bhatt, Adv.  
Ms. Nidhi Bhadola, Adv.

Ms. Devina Sehgal, AOR

Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR

Mr. Ajay Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Ram Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Maneesh Pathak, Adv.  
Mr. Dinesh Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Vivek Narayan Sharma, AOR  
Mrs. Niharika Dwivedi, Adv.  
Ms. Anita Chahar, Adv.

Mr. Abhimanyu Tewari, AOR  
Ms. Eliza Bar, Adv.

Ms. Rooh-e-hina Dua, AOR  
Mr. Harshit Khanduja, Adv.  
Mr. Ankit Khera, Adv.

Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR

Ms. Sushma Suri, AOR

Mr. C. K. Sasi, AOR

Mr. Neeraj Kishan Kaul, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Saurabh Kirpal, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Percival Billimoria, Sr. Adv.  
Dr. Menaka Guruswamy, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Jasmine Damkewala, AOR  
Mr. Rajesh Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Harshwardhan Thakur, Adv.  
Mr. Lavkesh Bhambhani, Adv.  
Mr. Utkarsh Pratap, Adv.  
Mr. Sourabh Malhotra, Adv.  
Mr. Saurabh Chaudhary, Adv.  
Mr. Siddharth Garg, Adv.  
Ms. Vaishali Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Rachita Sood, Adv.  
Mr. Rajesh Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Divyam Dhyani, Adv.  
Mr. Divyam Khera, Adv.  
Ms. Nishtha Tyagi, Adv.



Mr. Tanimah Gaur, Adv.  
Mr. Nikhil Arora, Adv.

Mr. Arvind Gupta, AOR

Mr. Rajat Joseph, AOR

M/S. Lead Counsel, AOR

Ms. Usha Nandini V., AOR

Mrs. Gargi Khanna, AOR

Ms. Anne Mathew, AOR

Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR

Mrs. Mahalakshmi Pavani, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Swati Jindal, AOR

Mr. Sowmya China, Adv.

Mr. Abhimanyu Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Nidhi Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Kunal Kakumanu, Adv.

Mr. Gaurav Varma, AOR

Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR

Mr. Neeraj Kumar Verma, AOR

Mr. Ajit Sharma, AOR

Mr. Debmalya Banerjee, Adv.

Mr. Avishkar Singhvi, Adv.

Mr. Kartik Bhatnagar, Adv.

Ms. Esha Dutta, Adv.

Mr. Anmol, Adv.

Ms. Shaalini Agrawal, Adv.

M/S. Karanjawala & Co., AOR

#### Intervenor-in-person

Mr. Anand Grover, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Purushottam Sharma Tripathi, AOR

Ms. Varnika Singh, Adv.

Mr. Ravi Chandra Prakash, Adv.

Mr. Amit, Adv.

Ms. Vani Vyas, Adv.

Mr. Abhishek Tripathi, Adv.

Mr. Aman Ashesh, Adv.

Mr. Khuloos Aziz Chawla, Adv.  
Mr. Prakhar, Adv.

Mr. Munawwar Naseem, AOR

Mr. Azmat Hayat Amanullah, AOR  
Mr. Arpit Yadav, Adv.  
Ms. Dipali Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. Vishal Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Niket Kumar, Adv.  
Ms. Anjali Gandhi, Adv.  
Mr. Sandeep Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Astha Tyagi, AOR

Ms. Supriya Juneja, AOR

Mr. Nirbhay Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Nishant Mandal, Adv.  
Mr. Chand Qureshi, AOR  
Mr. Ashish Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Shukla, Adv.  
Mr. Jitendra Thakur, Adv.  
Ms. Divya Jaiswal, Adv.  
Mr. Golla Mallikarkjuna Yadav, Adv.

Mr. S. C. Birla, AOR

Ms. Anu Shrivastava, AOR

Respondent-in-person

Mr. Naveen Kumar, AOR

Mr. Abhay Anil Anturkar, Adv.  
Mr. Dhruv Tank, Adv.  
Ms. Bhavya Pande, Adv.  
Mr. Aniruddha Awalgaonkar, Adv.  
Ms. Surbhi Kapoor, AOR  
Mr. Bhagwant Deshpande, Adv.

Mr. Satyam Thareja, AOR

Ms. Anjali Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Deepak Bashta, Adv.  
Ms. Shagun Matta, AOR

Ms. Mirdula Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Hiesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. S.K. Rajora, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Kumar Chawla, Adv.

Mr. Akhileshwar Jha, Adv.  
Mr. Sandeep Singh Dingra, Adv.  
Mr. Saurabh Kumar Solanki, Adv.  
Mr. Naresh Kumar, AOR

Ms. Charu Sangwan, AOR

Ms. Vipasha Singh , AOR

Mr. Ankit Goel, AOR

Mr. V. K. Biju, AOR  
Mrs. Ria Sachthey, Adv.  
Mr. Chetanya Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Mayank Pandey, Adv.  
Mrs. Rubina Jawed, Adv.

Mr. Surendranath P V, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Biju P Raman, AOR  
Mr. Subhash Chandran K R, Adv.  
Ms. Krishna L R, Adv.  
Mr. John Thomas Arakal, Adv.  
Mr. Sawan Kumar Shukla, Adv.

Mr. Romy Chacko, AOR

Mr. Ashwani Kumar Dubey, AOR

Ms. Anu Shrivastava, AOR

Mr. Sanjiv Sen, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR  
Mr. Ameet Siingh, Adv.  
Ms. Payal Swarup, Adv.  
Mr. Devesh Maurya, Adv.  
Mr. Ravi Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Aniket Raj, Adv.  
Mr. Syed Zafar Husain, Adv.  
Ms. Pratishtha Majumdar, Adv.

Mr. John Mathew, AOR

Mr. M. Gireesh Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Ankur S. Kulkarni, AOR  
Ms. Uditha Chakravarthy, Adv.  
Ms. Shalaka Srivastava, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Prasad, AOR

Respondent-in-person

Mr. Puneet Singh Bindra, AOR  
Mr. Akshay Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Rishabh Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Sameer Sethi, Adv.

Mr. Anand Grover, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR  
Ms. Mantika Haryani, Adv.  
Ms. Muakan Surana, Adv.  
Mr. Sanjeev Kaushik, Adv.

**Petitioner-in-person**

Mr. Rahul Bajaj, Adv.  
Mr. Talha Abdul Rahman, AOR  
Mr. Pritish Roy, Adv.  
Mr. M. Shaz Khan, Adv.  
Mr. Adnan Yousuf, Adv.

Mr. Mohammed Sadique T.A., AOR

Mr. Anish R. Shah, AOR

Mr. Pradhuman Gohil, Adv.  
Mrs. Taruna Singh Gohil, AOR  
Mr. Rushabh N. Kapadia, Adv.  
Mr. Mohit Prasad, Adv.  
Mr. Siddharth Singh, Adv.

Mr. P. N. Ravindran, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Roy Abraha, Adv.  
Mr. Ajay K. Jain, Adv.  
Mr. Himinder Lal, AOR

Mr. Vishnu Sharma, AOR  
Mrs. Anupama Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Amar Jyoti Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Usha Bhaskar, Adv.

**UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R**

The appeals/petitions stand disposed of and all the applications shall also stand closed in terms of the signed order.

**(NIDHI AHUJA)**  
AR-cum-PS

**(VIRENDER SINGH)**  
BRANCH OFFICER

[Signed order is placed on the file.]